



Ground Authenticities Following the Baloch Insurgency in Pakistan, 1948-2005: A Critical Analysis

Shumaila Rafique¹, Dr. Abdul Zahoor Khan²

¹Ph.D.-Scholar, Department of Politics and International Relations, Faculty of Social Sciences, Maryum Block, New Campus, Sector#H-10, International Islamic University, Islamabad-Pakistan,

²*Assistant Professor-History/In-Charge, Department of Anthropology, Faculty of Social Sciences, Faculty Block #I, First Floor, New Campus, Sector#H-10, International Islamic University, Islamabad-Pakistan

Received: March 7, 2017

Accepted: August 23, 2017

ABSTRACT

Balochistan largest province of Pakistan and hub of minerals resources has always been prone to ethnic insurgencies since independence of Pakistan. State faced a sequel of insurgencies in Balochistan. Its first insurgency started on Kalat Issue which emerged soon after independence in 1948. Upshots of first conflict lead to four other ethnic conflicts in Province which cause to subvert the relations of federal and province. To find out the root causes of the Baloch insurgency and the conflicts those have risen in the province of Balochistan. The paper discusses in detail the history of the grievances and the complexes that the Baloch community has had to face over the years. Paper focused on the internal factors that have contributed to the social unrest in the province including the political deprivation, economic discrimination, social instability and security problems. Analysis shows that the government policies and the lack of communication among institutions caused to raise ethnic phenomena. The federal and the provincial government's work(s) in the health infrastructure, and education department are discussed thoroughly to unfold the causes behind the disruption and unrest in the province. State took a number of initiatives to address the grievances of Baloch people and to resolve ethnic strife in which abolition of concurrent list, 18th amendment, Balochistan package are included. However, these steps have not been considered proven sufficient to address the grievances of Baloch people and state needs to adopt a variety of measures to bring considerable improvement in the situation.

KEYWORDS: Balochistan, Insurgency, Ethnicity, Institutions, Government Policies

INTRODUCTION

Pakistan is a diverse country, from castes to cultures and versatile climates. Different tribes and their own customs, people from different ancestors and backgrounds rallied together to attain a separate homeland in the sub-continent. All of these separate entities combined and came under a single flag; the flag of Pakistan. With a new state and the experienced leader, Jinnah, passing away soon, the foundations were never laid properly. Coming through difficult phases of wars and unsettled system, there have been problems that have affected the country. The well-off province of Punjab and to some extent Sindh and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP), have been the focus of many governments. On the other hand, Baluchistan has suffered from indifference. It has given rise to insurgency and unrest in the Baloch province. The enemies like India have used it to their advantage, but there are several other causes for this unrest and conflict that is weakening the federation of Pakistan.

The conflict in Balochistan is not a nascent one. It has emerged, evolved and intensified over a long period of time. The factors that led to the rise of insurgency and escalation of violence in Balochistan are multiple and complex, with internal as well as external dimensions. Ranging from the inherent weaknesses in the policy making process and consequently leading to flawed and controversial policies to mishandling the problems from different sections of society and institutions of state are among the key factors. When history of Balochistan is taken into account, accusations of Baloch cannot be overlooked. Their grievances are deeply entrenched in their denunciation of political rights, tenacious control of federal government, fear of domination of Punjabis, insufficient representation in institutions, lack of commitment on part of the state machinery towards development of the province, financial reservations, alarming situation of poverty, low literacy rate, unemployment and other such problems. The Baloch people however claim that the state does not provide due share to the province despite their immense distribution of resources and wealth contribution to the state. This claim has engendered mistrust, insecurities and eventually a multi-layered conflict.

Corresponding Author: Dr. Abdul Zahoor Khan, Assistant Professor-History/In-Charge, Department of Anthropology, Faculty of Social Sciences, Faculty Block #I, First Floor, New Campus, Sector#H-10, International Islamic University, Islamabad-Pakistan, E-mails: dr.zahoorkhan@iiu.edu.pk; dr.zahoor2008@gmail.com

It is believed that group inequalities in state dilapidate the fabric of society and state in many ways. Most importantly, economic disproportion in the form of less-than-due share in resources and Political inequity as less-than-deserved representation in national political affairs lead to a conflict that triggers violence if not treated in time and according to social contract. [1] A number of theories and hypotheses attempt to explain the cause-and-effect relationship of various factors with a conflict. One noticeable example is the Greed Hypothesis that explains the emergence of grievances and its relationship with conflict within a state. According to this hypothesis, tribal or group leaders are in struggle to become more powerful, thus the lust for power and greed for hegemony create sense of deprivation and grievances among rest of society. [2] Grievance is an individual's belief that he or she (or a group or organization) is entitled to have a resource which someone else may grant or deny. People respond to such beliefs in various ways. They may, for example, choose to "lump it" so as to avoid potential conflict. They may redefine the problem and redirect blame elsewhere. They may register a claim to communicate their sense of entitlement to the most proximate source of redress, the party perceived to be responsible. There are certain circumstances or situations that trigger such insecurities and grievances among groups of people. When a person or groups of persons endure ill treatment from other dominated/person party, they develop some kind of resentment. These resentments set grounds to create grievances which turn into conflicts when their demands are not met. Conflicts occur mostly due to the scarcity of resources. When people living in one civil society, claiming equality for resources and do not get their claimed share according to their culture, dignity and identity, they come in conflict with each other.

Government policies play their due role in mitigating or instigating conflicts in society. If governmental policies would not be according to the distinct culture/demand of people, resentments would keep on growing. This, in turn, would result in onset or emergence of an active conflict that has been dormant for years. People start to organize and recognize themselves on the ethnic lines. These ethnic lines foster a sharp sense of peculiar identity that promotes politics of ethnicity, identity and (sub) nationalism in state. This has been the case with Baloch ethnic movement as well. Being centred on a set of grievances which either went unaddressed or were dealt with inadequate measures and policies, the conflict kept on growing over decades, hence becoming more complex and intense.

SOURCES OF INSURGENCIES/ CONFLICT

In order to understand the dogma of Baloch ethno political conflict in Pakistan, various dimensions and factors (both internal and external) need to be taken into consideration. Since this particular study is intended to focus on internal dimensions, some major internal factors have been enlisted here, including but not limited to:

1. Political issues
2. Security issues
3. Economic issues
4. Social /Ethnic issues

1- POLITICAL ISSUES

The creation of Pakistan was the result of an organized political movement with stated objectives to work for the promotion and protection of political rights of people in general and of Muslims of India in particular. However, since independence, political issues have been at the root of various ethnic and sub-national movements in almost all the federating units of Pakistan at some point of time. Even after the separation of one such unit as Bangladesh, political grievances of the remaining parts were not given proper consideration, especially in the case of Balochistan. Some key political issues behind the rise of Baloch ethno-national movement can be enlisted as:

(i)-The Issue of Provincial Autonomy

The issue of provincial autonomy of Balochistan, the question of ethnic identity of Baloch and the struggle for their rights are intertwined and cannot be separated. Since 1971, the issue has been raised by various Baloch leaders as they vowed for confederation, maximum autonomy within federation, and demanded change in the provincial boundaries to create a comparatively homogeneous province. However, since Balochistan had got the status of a province; its performance and role as an active federating unit have been very limited in comparison with other provinces. All governments, whether civilian or military, focused on the centralization of power. Their refusal to give provincial autonomy is primarily responsible for the rise of ethnic conflict. PPP's government in 2008 tried to resolve the issue and abolished the concurrent list. It was an effort to ensure political autonomy of the provinces but the government of Balochistan was not satisfied. [3]

(ii)- Political participation

Balochistan had remained relatively quiet for almost two decades, after the end of the insurgency in 1980 until the return to the civilian rule in 1988, which brought the Baloch nationalists into political mainstream. Although their major demands relating to gas royalties and the allocation of federal resources remained unfulfilled, democracy provided the Baloch population with at least a sense of political participation, but the return of military rule in 1999 ended that relative calm. Tensions mounted when the military started building new cantonments in 2004. The move was seen as a means to further

tighten federal control over the province and the apprehension was not without basis. Instead of addressing the genuine grievances of the Baloch people, the military opted to a ruthless operation.

This was not for the first time that the Baloch political grievances were met with strict measures by the state. For years, an overwhelming majority of Baloch nationalists had rejected secession and later on struggled for autonomy within the framework of the Pakistani federation. Some others, however, had been moderate and flexible in their demands. But state repression blurred this division of hardliners and moderates among Balochis, pushing many moderates to ally themselves with the radicals. A large number of nationalist parties' cadres joined the armed struggle. As Balochistan had descended into anarchy, the state's authority gradually eroded especially after the new wave of violence during Musharraf era. The military seemingly managed to contain the insurgency, but failed to win the trust of the alienated population or to effectively establish the writ of the state in a large part of the province. The conflict has also instigated a division among the political families. While Akhtar Mengal was leading his party into the elections, his younger brother Javed Mengal had his loyalties with the insurgents. Certainly this chaos presents a very dire political scenario, but an uninterrupted democratic process is the only way to restore the confidence of people of Balochistan in the federation. The decision by the nationalist parties to return to electoral politics despite the threat of violence is indeed a step forward in Balochistan's struggle for democratic rights.

(iii)- Allegation of Foreign Sponsorship

Due to its location at the crossroads and the mineral resources of the province, the state of Pakistan has been keen to link the Baloch problem with foreign conspiracy and involvement.[4] It is naturally an attractive location for regional powers who try to access central Asian riches through its land [5]. At the regional level, India and China have always been part of the power equation for economic and geopolitical reasons. According to Wirsing (2008), Grare (2006) and Baloch (2007), there are compelling reasons for urgent action by either country or the Baloch people due to their various interests. For example, the Baloch public response to India is different from the rest of Pakistan. Due to having a history of resentments towards the state of Pakistan and given the Indo-Pakistan rivalry, the Baloch view India as a likely supporter. Similarly, contrary to the general support for China among rest of Pakistanis due to its strategic and mutual interests, the Baloch tribe has been largely antagonistic towards growing Chinese presence in the province in collaboration with the government of Pakistan for various projects. Both countries are regional, economic and hold military powers as well as engaged in a mutually hostile and competitive relationship. A report published by *The Guardian*, entitled Gwadar: Pakistan's new Great Game, states:

"It appears that there is a long-term plan to eventually connect the Karakoram highway with Gwadar. This is upsetting the other emerging superpower of the region, India, who does not want China's security establishment to have safe passage to the Arabian Sea. The fear they have been articulating is that Gwadar might become a naval outpost for the Chinese" (*The Guardian*, 2011b).

While the probability of foreign involvement cannot be completely overlooked, it has been the internal issues most of the time that went unaddressed or mishandled in the case of Baloch conflict. Ignoring all other factors, the stance of the state of Pakistan on the Balochistan conflict is different from that of the Baloch nationalist leadership. The Pakistani State sees it as a problem of the *Sardars*. Based on such portrayal by the Pakistani historians, it is perceived that only a few *Sardars* are supported by foreign countries (particularly Israel and India) in their attempts to break up Pakistan. The official approach in Balochistan is that 'everything is alright' and only a few hundred miscreants and *Sardars*, supported by foreign hands, have to be dealt with. By eliminating these few *Sardars* and their supporters, they argue, Balochistan will return to normality. Their preferred approach, like all occupying forces, is simply to eliminate them. One might argue that the problem of Balochistan is not the issue of a few *Sardars* but a multidimensional conflict that includes socio-economic, political and historical grievances that need to be addressed. Government and intelligence officials believe that some foreign forces are also stoking violence in the province, where ethnic, political, sectarian and militant lines have crisscrossed to further destabilize the province.[6]

(iv)- Inter and Intra-tribal Conflict

The Baloch society is tribal in nature. In determining the Baloch identity, much importance is given to tribes and clans. Through decades, the Baloch tribes were used to live under tribal confederacy. There are almost seventeen (17) major tribal groups and some four hundred (400) sub groups [7]. The Tribal affairs are conducted by their tribal traditions and their power holders are *Sardars*. Hasil Bizenjo points out in one of his interviews that under the Sandman system of governance during the British rule; the concept of tribal chiefs was properly introduced. Not only more tribes were created but converted into hereditary institutions. Sandman also determines the salaries of some tribal chiefs. If the *Sardars* had refused to obey the British orders, they were denied their salaries and other privileges. [8]

Nowadays, different areas of Balochistan are possessed by the assorted tribal chiefs which are one of the major reasons behind lack of cohesiveness and national integrity. Some of the tribes have also formed their political parties to show their presence in the mainstream politics. For instance, the Balochistan National party Mengal Group (BNP-M) is one such party. The Jamhoori Watan Party (JWP) of Bugti tribe and Baloch Haq Talwar were organized by Nawab Khair Bukhsh Murri.

Despite the fact that these Baloch Tribes are struggling for Baloch identity and rights, yet their tribal system is not integrated with each other. All of the tribes follow their own tribal norms. They have their own separate traditions to govern the tribesmen. Some tribes have traditional animosity with each other. Moreover, apart from the intra tribal conflicts, the internal cleavages also remain an important problem, adding to the complexity of the matter.

(v)- Federal Administrative Policies

The Baloch tribes claim that the Bhutto government in 1970s did not respect the mandate of Baloch representative and dissolved the Mengal provincial government. It was an undemocratic act of the federal government. Later in 1980's, most of the Baloch leaders were in mainstream Politics and in that era, no significant conflict was witnessed. [9] The process of inclusion and exclusion in national policies has helped ethnic groups to identify with their ethnic lines. Moreover, the inclusion among state apparatus has also aided ethnic groups to get rid of their opposition sentiments and bring them closer to each other while the exclusion of some of the specific group from the national affairs has certainly caused tremendous grievances. These grievances are heightened by poor governance. Baloch feel that their exclusion process from the state is consciously pursued by the federal government that creates disharmony among the Baloch and federal government.

2- SECURITY ISSUES

Given the pivotal position of Balochistan and the rich base of natural resources together with political controversies since the time of inception, security issues in the province have been bothering Pakistan throughout the history. These issues are multi-layered and have emerged as a cause as well as an effect of the Baloch conflict. Some of these include; the heavy presence of security forces despite a very scares population in the province and various operations in Balochistan depict the extent of alarming situation of law and order. The Balochistan security affairs centre on the grim law and order situation when the provincial government was dissolved on security concern in 1973 by the Prime Minister Zulfikar Ali Bhutto and the governor rule was imposed there. The dissolution of Balochistan provincial government by the federal government added to the bitterness in relationship between the political elite and law enforcement agencies. This dilemma created security concerns in the province and as witnessed, security agencies are being suspected by the people; military Intelligence (MI) and Frontier Corps (FC) served under the command of federal government[10]; locals have been complaining about the role of these forces as they looked down upon them, show their scourge. This enhanced the uncertainty widespread in the state especially in Balochistan.

The Baloch Community however, is currently confused about the state strategies regarding Balochistan. Senator Mir Hasil Bizenjo indicates the security concerns and has inquired about the role of army to increase peace and lower down the crime rate in the respective province.

(i)- Militarization of Conflict

Since its inception in 2004, the Pakistan's Baloch insurgency was caught up in the worst infighting ever known to the general public. Different left-wing underground armed groups that had been fighting Islamabad for a free Baloch homeland have now started to attack each other's camps. If the infighting exacerbates, Islamabad would have solid reasons to rejoice the end of one of the two deadly insurgencies it has been facing for nearly a decade (the other being the Taliban insurgency). Overshadowed by the deadlier Taliban insurgency, the Baloch resistance did not draw ample attention in the national media but it has certainly been a matter of deep concern for the past three consecutive governments. The Baloch insurgents had attacked almost all prime installations of the Pakistani government, including the military cantonment in Quetta, Balochistan's capital; important government buildings and killed senior government officials. The Militarization of Baloch conflict includes the increase in the use of violent tactics and policies by all major conflict parties. Two important dimensions of gradual militarization of Baloch issue are briefly overviewed here. As an organized movement with a variant use of violent tactics, the Baloch had confronted the Pakistani state on at least four occasions in the past. The Pakistani government adopted numerous approaches to undermine the Baloch resistance but none of these approaches really worked until infighting crept through the ranks of the Baloch. In the past, Islamabad carried out military operations, bought the loyalties of rival tribal chiefs or empowered the so-called moderate leadership of the Baloch and also sponsored religious extremist groups in order to counter the Baloch nationalists. All such policies failed to completely uproot the resistance in the mineral-rich region. There has only been one antidote to the Baloch movement: Infighting. This fact however has further complicated the situation by adding to militancy and widespread violence in the province.

(ii)- Military Operations

Since independence, the relationship between the Pakistan army and Balochistan has been mostly antagonistic with both having apprehensions about objectives, intentions as well as the role of each other within the state of Pakistan. Soon after independence of Pakistan, military operations were carried out in Kalat state. The history of Baloch clearly shows that their grievances increased with the military operations in 1948, 1957, 1969, 1973, and in 2005.[11]. The former Chief Martial Law Administrator (CMLA) Zia ul-Haq was quoted as saying that he would "ideally like to break up the existing provinces and replace them with fifty-three small provinces, erasing ethnic identities from the map of Pakistan altogether." [12]

These military operations however hindered the development of friendly relations between military and people of Baloch. The military action in Balochistan was according to need of the hour in the government's view while the Baloch took it as a brutal response by the state to suppress their identity and honour, not giving a heed to their genuine problems. This issue grew in intensity and scope with the passage of time. The militancy reached at high pitch and matured into political demands. In addition to other factors, the ruthless use of force by the state agencies has become a rallying point among the Baloch masses despite their tribal, cultural or group differences. The military operation of 2005 in Balochistan gave a new momentum to the Baloch movement. The demand for maximum provincial autonomy had ultimately switched to insurgency and separation.[13]. This shift in turn has been undermining the process of nation building. The centralized policies could not mitigate the differences and have failed to unite the nation to a larger extent.

(iii)- Geo-Strategic Compulsions and Exogenous Influence

Donald Horowitz (1985) explains the importance of external backing for an ethnic movement that needs support to gain strength.[14] Accordingly, if an ethnic group fails to obtain external support for their cause, it can contribute to the failure of the movement. External support provides material and moral backing. It includes finance, training, weapons and sanctuaries for militants. External factors are also important in escalating or defusing the conflict. However, as far as the Baloch ethnic movement is concerned, the widely held perception is that the Baloch tribes have never secured an international support for their separatist cause. [15]. Despite the fact, it is argued by the Pakistani media that without foreign assistance, insurgency of this magnitude cannot be sustained. A widely held belief is that Indian, Iranian, Afghani and U.S agencies are involved to strengthen the Baloch insurgency. Provided the fact that Iran has a considerable proportion of Baloch population with a history of low-intensity insurgency, any action that strengthens the cause of Baloch ethnic nationalism could be equally dangerous to Iran as well.

3- ECONOMIC ISSUES

Over the years, the economic situation of Balochistan has caused alarm bells and federal decision makers needed to put together their efforts to keep the situation from worsening. The Baloch community has shown displeasure over the centralized policies of the state. Human capital is also available from Balochistan in low quantity while the Baloch alleges the federal government of unfriendly and discriminatory economic policies towards Balochistan.[16]. The expectations of the people of Balochistan for economic revival and growth from major projects over the past decades have seen disappointment to a larger extent. The Saindak development project came down to halt about ten years ago due to the unavailability of Rs. 1.5 billion. From the Gwadar project, Balochis are expected to receive only 2% share. Agriculture has not been producing much due to the scarcity of water in the province. Grazing land gradually is deemed to be reducing due to the unavailability of required water and horticulture dominates agriculture. Similar to other problems, economic issues in Balochistan are complex and multidimensional. The key aspects have been highlighted here.

(i)- Mineral Resources

The province of Balochistan is blessed with natural resources yet considerable economic development at any level cannot be seen in the province.[17]. Balochistan's natural possessions contribute in great measure to state economy but the province does not benefit from its own resources. Since independence, the province of Balochistan lags behind in development when it comes to comparison with other provinces. It leads to augment mistrust, sense of deprivation and insecurity among masses when they cannot enjoy their own resources. One of the major apprehensions of Baloch is that they are not benefitting from their own resource i.e. Sui gas, gold, gypsum, coal etc. they are not allowed to explore their provincial resources, mineral or marine. This kind of action creates complexities in relations of federal and its units which gradually turn into grievances. These grievances are steadily crooked into movements and militancy. Ignoring the root causes and not addressing the problems, when the establishment tries to suppress them with force resulting in these movements turning into separatist movements. There are number of factors contributing to the increase of grievances amongst the Baloch which require careful and objective analysis and evaluation by the state. To comprehend this issue, there are two premises with regard to the grievances of Baloch. One is grounded in the federal policies which reinforce the policies of establishment in enhancing the grievances of Balochistan, while the other is the allegation that the Baloch tribal leaders have always remained in power, but failed to develop their area due to their vested personal interest. These Baloch grievances consequently strengthened with the passage of time.

(ii)- Mega Projects

As perceived by the Baloch, the developmental ventures in Balochistan are exclusively undertaken for ruling elites and not for the general masses of the province. The key claim of Baloch is certainly confined to the Gawadar port, a plan of the federal government being accomplished with the help of China in south-western city of Gawadar.

Ironically, such mega developmental projects that were initiated in the province also contributed to grievances in Balochistan. Pakistan invested \$50 million in collaboration with \$198 million Chinese investment in the development projects. However, the local Baloch's hopes to attain jobs in these projects were met with disappointment. The Baloch

nationalist are of the view that these projects will cause the pouring of people from other provinces that would dilute their majority and culture. . In response to such fears, Zubaida Jalal, the federal minister from Balochistan was made to assure people that these developmental projects would not harm culture of locals rather would financially benefit them and bring opportunities for all. The Baloch nationalists have been demanding control of Provincial government over such projects. Promises by the federal government(s) for maximum role of Baloch in mega projects are yet to see any substantial development.[18]

(iii)- Economic Deprivation

Balochistan is the hub of natural resources. Issues regarding the control of these resources by non-Balochis and the exploitation of Balochistan by other federating units have been echoing since decades. According to a source, thirty nine out of fifty mineral resources originate in Balochistan that earn great revenue for the country.[19]. The Baloch leaders are in a flux of blaming the federal government for stealing their resources. Among the natural resources playing a vital role in the economy of the state, Sui gas is an important natural resource.[20]. The gas deposit was discovered at Sui in 1953. In 1964, Sui gas was being supplied to Multan and Rawalpindi in Punjab but could not be supplied to Quetta till 1986, the capital of Balochistan. Dera Bugti provides 45% real of gas of total consumption of country.[21]. It is estimated that the Balochistan province is generating an annual output of gas of Rs. 45billion while getting only 7 billion as royalty. Dera Bugti was given Sui gas in the mid-nineties. There are only four out of twenty six districts of the province which are supplied with gas. Only 17% gas is being consumed in Balochistan province while 83% is guzzling in rest of the country. Balochis are demanding the revision of gas royalty otherwise they threaten to prevent further exploration of gas wells. According to the Prof. Aslam, “in Balochistan the major source of revenue is natural gas. The province contributes roughly \$1.4 billion per year through gas revenues, but receives only \$116 million from the federal government in royalty.”[22] The province lacks substantial educational, communication and infrastructure facilities as well.

4- SOCIAL/ETHNIC ISSUES

Balochistan is the geographically largest yet least populated province of Pakistan. Given the peculiar ethno-national fabric of the society together with the political and economic problems, a wide range of social issues have been plaguing the peace of the society and hindering the progress and prosperity of the province. Following is an overview of some important social issues and their connection with the Baloch ethnic conflict.

(i)- Missing Person Issue

The menace of a missing person got significant importance after the terrible incident of 9/11 which changed the political scenario of the world. In Pakistan, the problem of forced disappearances, extra-judicial detentions and killings have come forth as a major issue in past decades. Hundreds and thousands of people have been subjected to forced disappearances, detention and killings without being given the chance of a fair trial or hearing. The Balochs are in the largest proportion among the missing persons (either detained or killed by state agencies). As witnessed, hundreds of people have disappeared in the recent past. Many of them have been found later on as dead bodies with evidences of brutal torture. Those who survived narrated the perilous stories of physical and psychological torture. Hundreds are yet missing and their families have no clue about their existence whether they still are alive or dead. The situation has led to fears, insecurities and unrest among the general masses in Balochistan at one hand, while simultaneously creating more hatred, resentment and violence on the other. This issue is considered as one of the main sources of friction between the federal and provincial relations.[23].

The confrontation with agencies about missing persons deteriorated peace in the province. Baloch adopted non-cooperative approach towards government machinery. This situation delivered an immense blow to the socio-economic situation of country generally and of the province particularly. The killing of nationalist Baloch leader Ghulam Muhammad Baloch in 2008 and Habib Jalib in 2010 further infuriated the Baloch people.[24]. The relationship between the centre and the province worsened after such incidents. The trust-building efforts of the central government have been going in vain. The Baloch, however, considers agencies responsible for the target killings which give rise to anger against institutions. This has been a major support for insurgents since they win the public sympathies, new recruitments especially from the resented families and general support from international

(ii)- Education

While the progress in education department has generally been sub-standard almost everywhere in Pakistan, the situation is even more critical in Balochistan. With the lowest degree of facilities and infrastructure for education as well as the tug-and-pull between the state authorities and Balochs, the social environment in the province gives little room for any educational or learning activities. On the other hand, this issue has significantly been adding to social anxiety and unrest with a large population of Balochs lacking education or training and expertise required to be a part of mainstream progress and development in Pakistan, leaving the masses in a deep rooted sense of depravity and discrimination with least representation in armed forces, civil and military bureaucracy and other departments.

Education is the basic tool to provide the expertise in any field for Baloch people. Balochistan is generally categorized as backward, educationally as well as technically. According to the Annual Status of Education's Survey, about 34.1 percent of children between the ages of one and sixteen are not enrolled in schools in Balochistan, which is largely considered as Pakistan's most neglected province.[26]. It has also been found that out of the children who are enrolled in pre-primary school, 77.7 percent do not get promoted to elementary school which certainly is a very worrisome situation. The survey finds that most children have very poor language and learning skills and the future generation is expected to be more illiterate than the previous. There is definitely a dire need for quality education, adequate school campuses and policies to ensure that all children are provided with opportunities to go to school, at least until they complete their middle years' education. It is really unfortunate that despite the awareness about the underdevelopment of the province, most promises made to Balochistan have never been kept and history has been repeating itself continuously. Pakistan has a low literacy rate which goes even lower in Balochistan respectively.

The government needs to make serious efforts over the literacy rate of Balochistan. This issue is generally piped down by the federal government as well as the provincial government of the concerned province. There are a number of structural problems which do not permit the general masses to receive education. The main reason of it can be strong tribalism as seen in the case of the general masses that do not have access to education. Poor education and inequality among members of society are very crucial as they because a number of problems that lead towards backwardness of people and area. Tribal leaders tend to blame the government for failure to facilitate people the way they deserve. On the other hand, the government is of the view that tribal leaders deny every step of development against their honour. In this conflict, the civil society becomes the real victim.

In the words of former Senator and Baloch leader, Sana Baloch:

"How can a region progress when it has more soldiers than teachers, more garrisons than universities, more naval bases than science and research centres and more funds for extermination rather than training? In Balochistan today, the Frontier Corps (FC) cantonments outnumber colleges, there are more police stations than vocational training centres and more check posts than government high schools." [26]

(iii)- Poverty

Poverty is a situation wherein a person is unable to meet the basic necessities of life to live a healthy life. The poverty rate is overall high in Pakistan. Compared with other provinces, the social and economic conditions in Balochistan are very poor. Balochistan covers almost half of land area of the country and is mainly the hub of natural resources. According to the civil society, the Balochis are not being allowed to use their own resources due to which the level of poverty is higher than other provinces. Poverty in Balochistan has increased due to the political fragmentation in the province. Since Balochistan received the status of a province in seventies, the correlation of federal and provincial governments is in a tight rope which is the main hurdle to the development in the province.

There are number of variables that determine and help to measure poverty in any society. Paulette Dieterlen describes two aspects of poverty i.e., the ethical and the economic aspects. The European Commission's definition of poverty is that "The poor shall be taken to mean persons, families and groups of persons whose resources (material, cultural and social) are so limited as to exclude them from the minimum acceptable way of life in the member states in which they live.

Poverty in Balochistan is a stark fact of life. In the province of Balochistan, more than half of the population has been living below poverty line since the independence of the country, despite the fact that the province has abundant natural resources. The Federation enjoys a high on the hug while people belonging to that area are in a perilous situation. According to the Baloch perception, military operations have knocked down the head of Baloch which has certainly created more complexities for the masses of Balochistan. Balochistan's poverty is multidimensional; common people are unable to enjoy health facilities and access to the safe drinking water- more than 20% have access to safe drinking water.

In a statement to a newspaper, Mir Khuda Bakhsh Marri mentioned that his people were unable to enjoy the fruits of their own resources. They were still using wood for their livelihood. This speaks volumes about the poor socio-economic conditions in Balochistan.

According to the survey of SDPI, it is estimated that 58.7 million people are living below poverty line in Pakistan in which 46% are in rural while 18% is urban population. In Balochistan, this poverty ratio is higher than any other province where 52% households are living below poverty line.[27]

According to the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (HRCP), military operations in Balochistan resulting in collateral damage, destruction of educational and health facilities, infrastructure and killings or detentions of bread earners of many families have pushed human life to a miserable point. Natural resources of the province have turned into threat or cause of violence for people of that area. People are unable to enjoy their own resources and gradually falling below the poverty line.[28]

To get rid of poverty, the government consequently developed special mechanisms for most poor areas where Balochistan was its major priority. An institution PPAF has been established since 2000 that is working for eradication of poverty. Balochistan has a number of crises and needs bold decisions for a socio-political and cultural change immediately. Initial work has started in nine districts of Balochistan where Kalat, Khuzdar, Quetta, Pishu, Killa Saifullah, Loralai, Ziarat and Musakhel are included. The government, with help of the United Nations Development Pakistan (UNDP) has initiated poverty reduction programme in Balochistan in which provincial government is also joined. The UNDP successfully mobilized community and assembled people who are considered good for the future. (UNDP, n.d.). In spite of federal and provincial government's efforts, the level of poverty has risen in the last years.[29]

(iv)- Fear of Punjabi Dominance

In Pakistan, Baloch was only 2% at the time of independence [30] having distinct language, culture, customs and traditions. After the separation of East Pakistan in 1971, Pakistan was left with four provinces that are, Punjab, Sindh, North West Frontier Province (NWFP) and Balochistan.[31]. In these provinces, Punjab is the largest by population while Balochistan has the largest area with only 5% of total population of Pakistan. So the demographic core of the nation lies in Punjab as compared to other provinces. Other provinces claim domination of Punjab with regard to different issues in which Balochistan's claims are most prominent. They claim that Punjabi dominance in state has created complexities and problems over the share of provinces from federal resources. Punjabis are over represented since the independence of Pakistan in military and bureaucracy. At the time of independence, the Bengalis were also in the mainstream of population comprised of 52% population. At that time, the Punjabis were the second major ethnic group. After the separation of East Pakistan, Punjabis got an advantage of being the largest demographic ethnic group. They secured a higher status in government structure and maintained their status in state institutions. These strong ethnic cleavages led towards the cutting off of different parts of country.[32]. The dominance of Punjabis has resulted into discontent of other provinces, especially Balochistan. The Baloch feared dominance by Punjabis and to save their identity, they started a struggle against the policies of establishment dominated by the Punjab.

Provinces called Pakistan as "Punjabized" due to the Punjab's domination of state institutions i.e., military and bureaucracy. They claim that the central/federal government has become centralized due to the over-representation of Punjabis in every institution.[33]

Balochistan, comprising of 43 per cent territory of Pakistan and abundant natural resources, has never enjoyed full autonomy since the independence of Pakistan. It is believed that it is the richest province with regard to natural resources but is least developed among all provinces. There are number of challenges such as water scarcity, remoteness, and dilapidated infrastructure that affect development in the province. Political issues are a product of economic underdevelopment of Balochistan. The province is afflicted by conflicts since the independence of Pakistan. There was a sequel of conflicts in 1948, 1958, 1969, 1973 and in 2005 that stirred an alienation of Baloch people from the state.

(v)- 1st Baloch Insurgency

Soon after the independence, the first issue that the state had to face was the Kalat State issue. The Kalat State had a separate identity that was based on the treaties and engagements with British India. It was Kalat that accepted the control of imperial Britain through treaty. At the time of independence, it was pronounced that Kalat would regain its original status of independence as it was before 1876. [34]

The Khan of Kalat had signed a memorandum with the British Indian government clarifying that Kalat would not be part of India or Pakistan. He claimed that the Baloch people do not have cultural and linguistic affinity with either state, i.e., India or Pakistan. He was determined for a separate independent Kalat State. Kalat refused to merge with Pakistan and declared its independence on 15th August 1947 and established its own parliament composed of two houses. Both houses, upper and lower, passed bill against the assimilation of Kalat state into Pakistan on 14th December 1947. [35] The state of Kalat decided to send a formal delegation to Karachi and then to the capital of Pakistan, for settling the matters of defence and its relations with Pakistan as it had decided before in an agreement on 11th August 1947. In the meantime, the Khan of Kalat decided to merge Kalat State with Pakistan and signed an agreement on 30 March 1948 claiming that Pakistan would save Kalat from the danger of India. [36] The decision of Khan of Kalat did not prove fruitful and consequently angered the masses who later began to show their wrath through multiple protests. Both houses of Kalat State collectively passed a bill against the assimilation.

At that time, Ahmad Yar Khan was known as the Khan of Kalat. According to him, he was forced to join Pakistan by the Pakistan military. [37]. On 27 March 1948, the Khan of Kalat signed an agreement of annexation of Kalat state with Pakistan. The military was used to annex the Kalat State. It was the first time for Pakistan to use military to annex a territory. This action of the government generated complex reactions in the people of Kalat. They started protests, but it proved superfluous.

Sequel of Ethnic Conflicts in Balochistan:

Conflict	Year	Leader(s)/org/ tribe	Main Issue	Type of Conflict
1 st conflict	1948	Karim Agha Khan	Kalat Issue/ Annexation of Kalat state.	Non violent ethnic conflict
2 nd conflict	1958	Nawab Nouroz Khan	One Unit Scheme	Non violent conflict
3 rd conflict	1969	All Baloch tribes	Parari resistance	Non violent conflict
3 rd conflict	1973	All Baloch tribes	Provincial autonomy	violent conflict
4 th conflict	2005	Bugti Tribe	Autonomy issue	violent conflict

Developed by Researcher

(vi)- 2nd Baloch Insurgency

After the mutiny in Kalat, the establishment took another decision that caused a crux of conflicts among the masses. It was the Commencement of parity among provinces. The action of establishment astonished people; Provinces refused to follow the decision of government which resulted into massive protests in both wings of Pakistan. All provinces stood against this order and started revolutionary movements. In Balochistan, this movement was led by Nawab Nauroz khan. In October 1958, this movement exploded due to the centralized policies of federal government and in meantime, Khan of Kalat was arrested by the government of Pakistan.

Khan of Kalat describes the situation in his autobiography, Inside Balochistan as

“The 6th day of October 1958 will ever remain fresh in the memory of the peoples’ of Baluchistan; for it was on this day that the forces of tyranny, oppression and bloodshed were let loose on the simple and innocent Baluchs of Kalat for no fault of theirs..... I gave up myself to the army which paraded with me on the road and streets of Kalat. I witnessed several of my men falling dead on the ground by the indiscriminate firing of the army.”[38]

It was Nawab Nauroz Khan who took up arms in resistance to the administrative policies formulated by the government. He wanted to get free of the Baloch who were in prison on the charges of treason. Nawab Nauroz Khan claimed that he was trying to save the specific identity of Baloch. This conflict ended in 1969 when General Yahya khan abolished the One Unit scheme. Through Legal Framework Order (LFO) General Yahya Khan disbanded the one unit plan and announced general elections in the country. He introduced the system of “One man, One vote” to avoid future conspiracies. At that time, Balochistan was granted the status of province on 1st July 1970.[39] Earlier, it was divided into the administrative councils and was administrated by the bureaucracy.

(vii)- 3rd Baloch Insurgency

A Maximum provincial autonomy and devolution of power is the true spirit of a federal system. In Pakistan, unfortunately, the central government has failed to build a federation in its true spirit and continuously used power in a more centralized way. After the separation of East Pakistan, the state needed policies that may unite the nation to avoid troubles in. The major cause of dismemberment of Pakistan was the representation issue and provincial autonomy. In this conflict, political and economic institutions had broken down to create an amenable mutual relationship.

Political power was used to depoliticize the economic demands. In General Yahya’s regime, it can be clearly seen that the Industrial Relations Ordinance (IRO) ⁱ of 13th November 1969 restructured the trade Unions.

The constitution said that the election commission would be responsible to hold elections in time, but time proved that this promise was never fulfilled and people started remonstrations on the delay of elections. The delay of elections created an anxiety among the masses. The government established an election commission for the delimitation of constituencies. This institution was not allowed to work properly. In 1958, the constitution was abrogated and the election commission also closed down.

It was promised by the state of Pakistan to bend over backward rearward for granting full autonomy to the provinces in true spirit of federation. Otherwise, ethnic issues could not be sorted out in an appropriate way. To sort out these issues, there is always a need to balance the centripetal and centrifugal forcesⁱⁱ to keep the system in balance. Otherwise dissymmetry between these forces would prove harmful for the integrity of a multicultural society like Pakistan.

When the new constitution was framed in 1973, it was supposed that it would be based on full provincial autonomy. Balochistan hoped to get its due share according to its vast area and enormous reserves. But once again, the Baloch was beaten around the bush which instigated them to initiate struggle for their due rights. It has resulted into a major uprising in Balochistan which turned out to be more aggressive than the previous ones.

(viii)- 4th Baloch Insurgency

The mutiny of 1973 was a political movement. Its primary slogan as equality of rights, as per the natural share but later it turned the other way, a separatist movement; demanding self-rule. Somehow this movement could not gather the support of majority as many tribal leaders had their own demands to be fulfilled. The Baloch rebellion had created civil disorder in the province; deteriorating law and order. This situation activated all federal forces and many Baloch politicians were arrested. This decision of federal government in province was impulsive and the grievances of Baloch people seemed a long from being removed. It had worsened the security situation in the province. Leaders of National Awami Party, Attaullah Mengal and Khan Abdul Wali Khan were arrested on the charges of treason. This case was dealt under a special tribunal, known as Hyderabad Tribunalⁱⁱⁱ which was established on the advice of Prime Minister Mr. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. In Balochistan, Mengal and Bizanjo promised to develop their province and strengthen the masses. Unfortunately, the government could not run effectively and was dissolved by the centre.

This action of government again called for the Baloch aggression, but federal government claimed that this dissolution was constitutional. Government was of the view that the provincial government of Balochistan had failed to improve security and law and order conditions. On these charges, the central government dissolved the Balochistan provincial government of Attaullah Mengal and imposed Governor Rule there, to restore peace and security. The central government banned all political activities of NAP. It claimed that NAP is involved in anti-state activities.

This whole situation prompted Baloch to call for radical measures. A number of Marri tribesman and Baloch students joined hands with one another and established Balochistan People's Liberation front (BPLF) [40] under the leadership of Khair Bakhsh Marri, the head of Marri tribe and started guerrilla warfare. The conflict continued and boosted with passage of time. This movement was an aggregation of nationalists who had planned their action to get independence. It was the separatist movement in which Baloch Sardars and leaders fell out with Pakistan army for five years. According to ballpark figure of Salig Harrison, 55,000 Baloch were engrossed in fighting in this insurgency and 11,500 of them in "organized hard-core units"[41]

There were a number of internal and external elements which added fuel to the fire. Baloch nationalists sought help from Iran and Afghanistan. The tension further increased when Pakistan army decided to construct new army garrison in troubled areas of Balochistan to get hold on the security situation. Baloch people had an aversion to this act of government and started to oppose it by building their own security check posts. [42] Insurgency further got impetus from this clash of province and government institutions. In this confrontation, another event exacerbated the situation and increased pressure from civil society in favour of army operation in the province. The cache of arms that was exposed at the Iraqi Embassy in Islamabad on February 10, 1973, was ostensibly meant for Baloch miscreants, and creating law and order situation the province. Over this incident, diplomatic relations with Iraq deteriorated. However due to diplomatic immunity, the Iraqi ambassador and diplomatic staff was exonerated and the case was closed. This incident showed the failure of security institutions to stop accumulation of such weapons in an embassy. Bureaucracy was highly criticized for security lapse.

Because of this whole scenario, the relations between centre and province further aggravated. To normalize the situation, the federal government decided to start military operation in the province. 80,000 army personnel were deployed for the operation. According to an estimate, in 1973-77, there were about 5,300 casualties of Balochis and 3,300 soldiers were killed. Finally after the death of hundreds of Balochs, the army cleared the insurgent elements, got control and restored law and order in the province.[43] Until the end of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto's regime, insurgent elements were challenging the state but after that, nearly for two decades their activities were not lime lighted. The problem in Balochistan, peculiar as it seeks to generate separatist and nationalist sentiments within a culturally distinct ethno-linguistic group that has had its own autonomous history; with little change. Pakistan faced diverse conflicts since its creation, but Balochistan's insurgency gave hard time to establishment. Level of conflicts varied in each phase and gradually ethnic conflict became nationalist separatist movement and more violent than before.

(ix)- Military Operation against Bugti tribe (2005)

The insurgent elements in Balochistan came to forefront once again in 2004. The main targets of rebellions were the developmental projects and gas pipelines. According to the BBC, there were more than 30 bomb attacks in Quetta alone during 2004. The deadliest of these killed at least 11 people and wounded over 30 in December 2004. The BLA and the Baloch Liberation Front (BLF) claimed responsibility for these attacks and stated that the attacks were an attempt to liberate Balochistan from Punjabi domination. Thus, 31-years after the last military operation in Balochistan, the armed forces were once again deployed in the province, to destroy terrorist training camps, protect vital economic installations like the Sui gas field, and vital projects such as the under-construction Gwadar port and Mirani dam.[44]

Political leadership instigated the situation and politicized the issues in their favour. Baloch nationalist leaders were bent upon the issue of self-determination, politicized ethnicity and were using every means to pursue their interest. Situation of

law and order was not pleasant, and to this the rape of Dr. Shazia by an army captain instigated the situation even further. The violence escalated in the province after this issue and relationship of province and central government once again deteriorated.

The issue of lady doctor's rape could not be solved and the military started operation there in 2005. That action was an about turn of federal government creating further fissures. Baloch started to get their act together against the establishment. The conflict was further reinforced after the signing of Gwadar port project agreement with China.[45]. For the accomplishment of this project, the federal took decision to build three military garrisons there. Also, the Federal government was looking at setting up new copper-gold and natural gas reserves, through multinational corporations like premier Shell and BHP of Australia. [46] The act of construction of military garrisons and invitation of foreign companies to explore of mineral reserves was unacceptable for Baloch. All these acts annoyed the tribal leaders who were not part of those negotiations held for settlements with foreign companies. The investment of foreign companies in Balochistan was taken as an assault on their honour, as there was no local participation in developmental projects. Baloch took this as a completely federal project, initiated to control their resources. Nationalist leaders mobilized their people, asking them to revolt, thus following a confrontationist way with the government.[47] & [48] The government went an extra mile to crush insurgency and attacked the hideouts of an influential tribal leader Akbar khan Bugti. Akbar Bugti was the chief leader of Bugti tribe.[49] This tribe is considered to be the most powerful tribe and it was also part of establishment in the past. He remained chief minister and governor of the same province. The killing of Bugti in an army operation exacerbated the situation. Military arrested political activists and started operation against Baloch National party (BNP) activities, to crush the insurgency. It is said that more than 700 people laid their lives in this operation. That military operation once again strengthened the belief of Balochi's over the centralized policies of the central government. This was the time when Balochistan issue attracted the attention of International community.[50] Baloch leaders started efforts for independence. All these elements left immeasurable impacts on state-building efforts. The State institutions again failed to apprehend the destabilizing conditions in the province.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The research concludes that the state along with all institutions has even yet, not diagnosed the nature of Balochistan. Moreover, there isn't any consensus whether the problem is a political and needs to be resolved through a dialogue or it's a form of terrorism and needs to be resolved through force or is it that needs financing, or above all; the identity crisis. Provincial autonomy was demanded dominantly in all Baloch insurgent movements. The 18th constitutional amendment provided provincial autonomy but this has not been opted practically.

The grievances and complaints of the Baloch people are justified. The policymakers and the community ought not to overlook these injustices but rather cater for the needs of the province that has been neglected for so long. To overcome the issue of insurgency, the root causes need to be understand. All the stakeholders along with the community have to stand up and solve this on urgent basis. From infrastructure to the concrete policies, there is need to develop a cordial relation between federal and provincial government along with the involvement of common man. It is paramount that the government along with all the entities of the system welcomes the Baloch people into the national fold. Work is already in progress but a lot remains to be done so that the people of Balochistan also live and enjoy their life and contribute to the development of Pakistan.

- There is a need to develop truly democratic apparatus which actually accommodates all ethnicities on equal basis.
- State needs to use the tool of "Management of Diversity" to redress the grievances of deprived ethnic groups.
- Social contract should be revised and reviewed in relation to power sharing mechanisms, among federating units and federation following the theory of Consociationalism. It would help to eliminate the superiority of one ethnic group over other.
- There is need to build trust of people in government policies through implementation of constitution's clauses, in a real manner.
- There is a need to enhance the performance of institutions.
- Civil society is the defining feature of state's policies. Baloch civil society is victim of poor working of institutions and also victim of tribalism. There is a need to evolve a mechanism that helps to decrease the gap of civil society, with that of formal institutions and to minimize the influence of tribal leaders.
- There is a greater responsibility of the decision-makers to understand the demands of Baloch and accommodate them according to constitution of 1973. There is a need to mobilize the middle class, to balance the society and to minimize the feudal effects.
- Empower institutions, in letter and spirit, according to the constitution.

REFERENCES

- [1] Murshed, S. M. (2006). *Turning Swords to Ploughshares & Little Acorns To Tall Trees: The Conflict-Growth Nexus & The Poverty Of Nations*. Birmingham: The Birmingham Business School of Netherland.online available http://www.un.org/en/development/desa/policy/wess/wess_bg_papers/bp_wess2006_murshed.pdf
- [2] Berdal, M., David M. Malone. (2000). *Greed And Grievances: Economic Agendas In Civil War*. Boulder Co: Lynne Rienner, pp.24-67
- [3] Fair, C. C. (2012). Beyond “Hearing” Range, Herald. March. Karachi. pp.28-30.
- [4] Binder, L. (1987). Islam Ethnicity and the State in Pakistan. In. Ali Banuazizi, (Eds.). *The State, Religion and Ethic Politics*. Boston: Myron, Weiner, Massachusetts, .pp.259-298.
- [5] Bizenjo, T. (1999). *Baba-e-Balochistan: Statements, Speeches and Interviews of Mir Ghous Bux Bizenjo*. Quetta, Sales and Services.
- [6] Butt, Q. (2013). Mengal admits foreign involvement in Balochistan, Online available <https://tribune.com.pk/story/573937/mengal-admits-foreign-involvement-in-balochistan/>
- [7] Jetly, R. (2004). Baloch ethnicity and Nationalism (1971-81): an assessment, *Asian ethnicity*, 5:1, PP 7-26DoI 10.1080/1463136032000168871. URL: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080>
- [8] Daily Dawn. (2006). Disarming of Militants needed for Peace: President Denies Army Action. (Editorial). Feb 4.online available <https://www.dawn.com/news/1069770>
- [9] Scholz, F. (2002). *Nomadism and Colonialism: A Hundred Years of Balochistan (1872-1972)*. Karachi: Oxford, pp-49
- [10] Agha, A. (2012). *Balochistan: Unending Tragedy*. Islamabad: Institute for Conflict Management, online available <http://www.eurasiareview.com/03122012-pakistan-unending-tragedy-in-balochistan-analysis/>
- [11] Maxwell, M. H. (2014). *The Comparative Approach to National Movements*, Routledge publishers, pp.15-26
- [12] Shahid, S. (2006). Grand Jirga in Kalat decides to move ICJ, online available <https://www.dawn.com/news/211514>
- [13] Wirsing, R. G. (2008). *Baloch Nationalism and the Geopolitics of Energy Resources: The Changing Context of Separatism in Pakistan* Strategic Studies Institute, U.S. Army War College, p. 27
- [14] Ibid, p.230
- [15] Jones. (2002)., p.135
- [16] Grare, F. (2013). *Balochistan. The State Versus the Nation*, Carnegie Endowment, online available <http://carnegieendowment.org/2013/04/11/balochistan-state-versus-nation-pub-51488>
- [17] Fazl-e-Haider, S. (2009). *Formulating a new developmental policy for Balochistan*:. Economist Publications, pp.19-21.online available <https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/project-document/68721/39003-pak-tar.pdf>
- [18] John, W. (2009). *Pakistan: The Struggle Within*. Pearson Education India. Pakistan, pp-18-33
- [19] Gazdar, H. (2007). *Balochistan Economic Report*. Background paper on social structures and Migration. Islamabad, online available http://www.researchcollective.org/Documents/Balochistan_Economic_Report.pdf
- [20] Khan, Z. (2012). Alarm bells ringing: Sui gas reserves to end in 10 years. online available Alarm bells ringing: Sui gas reserves to end in 10 years
- [21] Khwaja, M. Z., Suleri, Q. A., & Shahbaz, B. (2009). *Natural Resource Allocation in Balochistan and NWFP: Reasons for Discontent*, Sustainable Development Policy Institute.online available <https://www.sdpi.org/publications/files/Microsoft%20Word%20-%20A111.pdf>
- [22] Aslam, R. (2011). Greed, creed, and governance in civil conflicts: a case study of Balochistan, *Contemporary South Asia*, 19:2, pp-189-203,
- [23] Zulfqar, S. (2013). Balochistan’s peace linked to missing persons’ issue. Online available <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2013/12/14/balochistans-peace-linked-to-missing-persons-issue/>
- [24] Baloch, S. (2010). End of Endurance. *Ostomaan ostomaan.org/articles/news-and-views/6610*
- [25] Shah, Z. (2013). Balochistan becomes an afterthought. *Pakistan observer*.
- [26] Baluch, M. A. (2009). *Inside Balochistan – Autobiography The Khan of Kalat*. Online available. [tps://www.goodreads.com/book/show/8262874-inside-baluchistan](https://www.goodreads.com/book/show/8262874-inside-baluchistan)
- [27] Anwer, S. (2014).58.7m Pakistanis living below poverty line. Islamabad: SDPI, online available <https://tribune.com.pk/story/675805/sdpi-report-58-7m-pakistanis-living-below-poverty-line/>
- [28] Haider, S. F. (2006). Higher Poverty In Balochistan, Dawn. Online available. <https://www.dawn.com/news/177446>
- [29] Ahmad, A. (2009). Poverty rising in Balochistan, Dawn, Online available <https://www.dawn.com/news/849934>
- [30] Coakley, J. (2004). *The Territorial Management of Ethnic Conflict*. Routledge, pp.15-18

- [31] Lyon, P. (2008). Conflict between India and Pakistan: An Encyclopedia. ABC-CLIO, pp.23-27
- [32] Akhtar, A. S. (2007). Balochistan Versus Pakistan. Economic and Political Weekly. Vol. 42, No. 45/46, pp. 73-79
- [33] Lewis, R. A., & Mitra, S. K. (1996). Sub-national Movements in South Asia. West view Press, pp-43-68
- [34] Ali, S. S. (2001). Indigenous Peoples and Ethnic Minorities of Pakistan: Constitutional and Legal Perspectives. Islamabad: Routledge, p.21
- [35] Axmann, M. (2008). Back to the Future: The Khanate of Kalat and the Genesis of Baloch Nationalism 1915-1955. Oxford University Press, p.42
- [36] Rehman, J. (2000). The Weaknesses in the International Protection of Minority Rights. England: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, pp-19-30
- [37] Hashmi, R. S. (2015). Baloch Ethnicity: An analysis of the issue and conflict with state. JRSP, Vol. 52
- [38] Ibid, pp.24-30.
- [39] Tyagi, V. P. (2009). Martial Races of Undivided India. Gyan Publishing House, pp.10-14.
- [40] Misra, A., Clarke, M. E. (2012). Pakistan's Stability Paradox: Domestic, Regional and International Dimensions. London: Routledge, pp.20-26
- [41] Harrison, S. S. (1981). In Afghanistan's Shadow: Baluch Nationalism and Soviet temptations. Carnegie endowment for International peace, pp.89-100
- [42] Shah, M. A. (1997). The Foreign Policy of Pakistan: Ethnic Impacts on Diplomacy 1971-1994. *The Journal of Asian Studies* Vol. 58, No. 1 (Feb., 1999), pp.247-249, Published by: Association for Asian Studies DOI: 10.2307/2658465 Stable URL: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/2658465>
- [43] Kundi, M. A. (2002). Balochistan: Hope and Despair. Quetta: New Quetta book Stall, pp-99-110
- [44] Fazl-e-Haider, S. (2004). Economic development of Balochistan: potential, constraint, issues & suggestions. Business & Economics., P-53.
- [45] Currier, C. L. (2011). China's Energy Relations with the Developing World. London. Continuum publishers. pp-17-38
- [46] Campbell, D. D. (2014). The Forgotten Refugees of Balochistan. Middle East Research and Information Project. online available. <https://www.merip.org/mer/mer244/forgotten-refugees-balochistan>
- [47] Ibid., pp.45-50
- [48] Dawn opinion. (2005). Saboteurs will fail, says Musharraf: Rockets fired during president's Kohlu visit. Online available. <https://www.dawn.com/news/170026>
- [49] Banerjee, P. (2005). Internal Displacement in South Asia: The Relevance of the UN's Guiding. India. SAGE Publications, pp.25-30
- [50] Editorial. (2006). Mr. Musharraf's Other War. New York Times. Online available <https://www.nytimes.com/2006/02/23/opinion/mr-musharrafs-other-war.html>

ⁱAn Ordinance to amend and consolidate the law relating to the formation of trade unions, the regulation of relations between employers and workmen and the avoidance and settlement of any the avoidance and settlement of any difference or disputes arising between them

ⁱⁱWhen The Central Government Is Associated In The Minds Of People With Different Culture Or Ethnic And When There Are Perceived Economic Opportunities To Be Gained By Separation. Centrifugal Forces Are Given By The Uneven Nature Of Economic Development. In These Circumstances, Some Of The Things Which Were Originally Classified As Centripetal Can Become Centrifugal In Effect.

ⁱⁱⁱThe Hyderabad tribunal (1975–1979), also known as Hyderabad conspiracy case, is the name of a former judicial tribunal used in Pakistan to prosecute opposition politicians of the National Awami Party on the charges of treason and acting against the ideology of Pakistan. The tribunal was set up on the orders of Pakistani Prime Minister Zulfikar Ali Bhutto.